

## Setting baselines for new marketbased mechanisms: Case studies from the cement and power sectors

#### **Paula Castro**

Side Event "Top-down, Bottom-Up or In-Between – What Future for the Carbon Market?"

Doha, 3 December 2012

3 Dec 2012

Page 1



Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies

#### New market-based mechanism

- Sector-level coverage
  - Sectoral crediting
  - Sectoral trading
- Baseline should depicts the future BAU emissions path
  - To be projected on the basis of technical-economic data
- Baseline different to the sectoral target or crediting threshold
  - Target or threshold have a political component to them



Sectoral crediting

## New market-based mechanism – Theory



3 Dec 2012 Setting baselines for new market-based mechanisms

Sectoral trading

University of Zurich<sup>uz</sup>

Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies

#### New market-based mechanism – Reality



Page 3



## What needs to be considered?

#### **Baseline scope**

- What activities the baseline will cover
  - A "sector"  $\rightarrow$  different definitions possible
  - Some sectors are heterogeneous
    - Product
    - Process
    - Time
    - Space
- Ideally, include a whole sector, but taking into consideration its structure
- → In general: the more disaggregated, the more accurate the baseline, but the less incentives / flexibility for broader mitigation actions, and the more data-intensive

3 Dec 2012 Setting baselines for new market-based mechanisms

Page 5



Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies

## What needs to be considered?

#### **Reference data**

- Ultimately, all baselines base on historical data
- But different ways to use it:
  - **PAST performance** of covered activities as the baseline, e.g.
    - A single historical time period
    - The average emissions level over several historical time periods
  - Or projection of **FUTURE projections** as the baseline, e.g.
    - Linear extrapolation of past emissions trend
    - Projection based on expected changes in growth rates of sector
    - Projection incorporating effects of expected changes in other variables (technological, economic, demographic factors)
- If no historical data: parameters based on manufacturers' specifications or default emission factors



#### What needs to be considered?

#### **Dynamics and updating**

- Used to incorporate effect of future changes in conditions affecting the sector
  - Fixed baseline:
    - Eg. 20% best emissions performance of all steel plants in the country over the period 2005-2010
    - Could include an autonomous emissions improvement factor (emission levels decline at a rate of 1% emissions each year)
  - Dynamic baseline:
    - Calculated anew each year as the sector progresses: e.g. 3-year rolling average emissions level of all steel plants in the country
  - Updating: every few years the baseline (or parameters within it) is updated; should not be used to "relax" the baseline
- Need to weigh speed of changes in the sector, with cost of revisions, and investment certainty

3 Dec 2012 Setting baselines for new market-based mechanisms

University of Zurich<sup>™</sup>

Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies

## What needs to be considered?

#### **Metrics**

- Absolute baselines: Total emissions in the sector
  - Assumptions about expected future level of activity in the sector
  - Expected growth in production / demand drivers uncertain
  - May lead to hot air
- Indexed or relative baselines: Emissions per unit of output
  - May not lead to net reduction in emissions if growth of sector is larger than gains in efficiency / relative emissions
- Technology-based baselines: level of penetration of desired technology
  - Reduced MRV costs
  - Can then be transformed to emission reductions higher uncertainty

Page 7



#### What needs to be considered?

#### **Conservativeness and stringency**

- Of the baselines technical analysis
- Of the target political component

3 Dec 2012 Setting baselines for new market-based mechanisms

Page 9



Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies

# Cement sector case study



#### **Cement sector in India**

- Data from the WBCSD's Cement Sustainability Initiative
  - Years 1990, 2000, 2005-2010
  - Coverage around 50% of Indian cement production; growing over time
  - Information on emissions from calcination and fossil fuel combustion
  - No information on indirect emissions from electricity consumption
  - Data aggregated for the whole sector; not for each plant
- Socioeconomic data and industry statistics
  - GDP, GDP per capita, population from WDI
  - Future projections from EIA's International Energy Outlook
  - Historic cement production from Indian Cement Manufacturers' Association
- Generated projections of sectoral emissions levels up to 2030

3 Dec 2012 Setting baselines for new market-based mechanisms

University of Zurich<sup>uzH</sup>

Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies

#### **Indexed baselines**

- Different projections used:
  - Linear extrapolation of historic emissions, all data
  - Linear extrapolation of historic emissions, last 6 years
  - Linear projection assuming 1% annual improvement in performance
  - Projections assuming different scenarios for future fuel consumption, cement-to-clinker ratio, use of alternative fuels
    - Role of main factors influencing emissions
      - Thermal efficiency in clinker production process
      - Type of fuel used
      - Blending ratio of clinker to other cementitious materials

Page 11



Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies



## **Indexed baselines**



Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies

#### 1000 800 Million tonnes cement 600 400 200 D 2000 2010 . 2020 . 2030 1990 Year Cement production, linear extrapolation of all data Cement production, linear extrapolation, last 10 years of data Cement production, exponential projection Cement production, projection based on GDP/cap and population Cement production, projection based on total GDP Cement production, historic RBI and CMA data ٠

#### **Cement production**



Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies



## **Absolute baselines**



Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies

#### Comparison





#### Lessons for baseline setting

#### - Scope:

- All plants in the system should ideally be included
  - Baseline can be aggregation of projections for sub-sectors / products
    - Transparent: about real trends, e.g. for different types of processes
    - Flexible: allows for reductions from changes in the sector structure
  - Not yet granted with current data

3 Dec 2012 Setting baselines for new market-based mechanisms

Page 17



Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies

## Lessons for baseline setting

#### - Reference data:

- Different types of projections yield different results
  - Transparency and sensitivity analysis crucial
- Consideration of drivers of emissions important
  - Understand implications of projections (e.g. need for blending materials for cement)
  - Avoid unrealistic projections
- Balance: the more drivers, the more assumptions, the less transparency
- The longer the timelines of historical data, the better results
- Information on vintages, capacities, fuel types, technologies used helpful to model drivers of emissions accurately → ideally at plant level
  - Pre-implementation phase to gather data



#### Lessons for baseline setting

#### Dynamics and updating:

- Baselines should be valid for as long as possible
  - Certainty for investors
- Updating necessary to strengthen the baseline

#### - General: ex-ante agreement / guidance on:

- Methods for projections
- Metrics
- Standard parameters (emission factors, demographic and economic data and projections)
- Sensitivity analysis

3 Dec 2012 Setting baselines for new market-based mechani
---

Page 19



Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies

## Power sector case study



## **Projections of specific CO<sub>2</sub> emissions per plant type**





Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies



## **Projections of fuel mix**



Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies

## Indexed baseline





Department of Political Science / Center for Comparative and International Studies

## **Absolute baseline**

